



Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

# Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum

The Trans-Asian Dimension of the OSCE:  
A Vital Security Link



Almaty, Kazakhstan  
7-9 June, 2003



## FORUM OVERVIEW

From 7-9 June 2003, in Almaty, Kazakhstan, the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly held a Forum focusing on 'The Trans-Asian Dimension of the OSCE: A Vital Security Link'. The Forum, organized by the OSCE PA in co-operation with the United Nations Development Programme and hosted by the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan, gathered more than 90 parliamentarians from 30 OSCE participating States and from OSCE partner States Japan, Korea and Egypt. Representatives of the Interparliamentary Assembly of Member Nations of the CIS, the Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly, the Parliamentary Union of the Organization of Islamic Conference Member States as well as the diplomatic corps in Almaty and numerous NGOs also attended the Forum.

The *Opening Session*, entitled '*Ten Years of Nation and Institution Building: Lessons Learned*', was addressed by Bruce George, President of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, Nursultan Nazarbaev, President of Kazakhstan, Oralbai Abdykarimov, Speaker of the Senate of Kazakhstan, Zhamarkhan Tuyakbai, Speaker of the Majilis of Kazakhstan, Fikret Akcura, UNDP Resident Representative in Kazakhstan, and Jan Kubiš, Secretary General of the OSCE.

'*The Fight against Terrorism: Successes and Lingerings*' was the focus of the *First Session*, during which the participants heard keynote speeches by Lynn Pascoe, US Deputy Assistant Secretary of State

for European and Eurasian Affairs, Kasymzhomart Tokaev, Foreign Minister of Kazakhstan and Shavkad Ismailov, Chair of the Committee on Defence in the Parliament of Tajikistan.

The *Second Session* on 8 June dealt with '*The Economy and the Environment: The Link to Long Term Security*' and was addressed by Kairat Kelimbetov, Minister of Economy and Budget Planning of Kazakhstan, Alexander Carius, Director of Adelphi Research, and Victor Dukhovny, Director of the Scientific-Information Centre of the Interstate Co-ordination Water Commission in Central Asia.

The *Third Session* focused on '*The Development of Democratic Institutions: Stepping Stone to Regional Security*'. Keynote speakers included Alexander Veshnyakov, Chair of the Central Election Commission of the Russian Federation, Ahmet Tan, Journalist and former Vice-President of the OSCE PA, Christian Strohal, Director of the ODHIR, and Willem Hendrik de Beaufort, Secretary General of the Dutch House of Representatives.

Closing the Trans-Asian Forum with a *Final Statement*, OSCE PA President George applauded the overall success of the Forum in reaching its main goal of raising awareness and increasing parliamentary dialogue on issues of security in the trans-Asian dimension of the OSCE.



SATURDAY, 7 JUNE 2003

**OPENING SESSION***TEN YEARS OF NATION AND INSTITUTION BUILDING: LESSONS LEARNED*

**Bruce George,  
President of the OSCE PA**

In his opening address, President George extended the collective gratitude of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly to the Kazakh hosts for their hospitality in welcoming the parliamentarians to Almaty for the first meeting of the Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum. He noted that the participation of such a large group of Assembly Members in the Forum is indicative of the fact that Central Asia has become a region of great interest and importance to the OSCE and its participating States. President George pointed out that the relationship between the OSCE PA and the Central Asian States is not a new one. He recalled the numerous visits of OSCE Presidents to the region, the OSCE PA Seminar organized in Tashkent in 1997, and the election observation missions headed by Members of the Assembly in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan, as well as the more recent field visits to OSCE field offices in Uzbekistan and Kyrgyzstan.

President George expressed his pleasure at seeing such a large turnout at the Forum, which illustrates that developments in the trans-Asian dimension of the OSCE have an influence far beyond the countries

located in that geographical space. He specifically welcomed the presence in Almaty of Members of Parliament from most of the Central Asian and Partner for Co-operation States.

Regarding the theme of the Forum, President George emphasized that genuine security in Central Asia cannot be advanced without improvements in the economic conditions in which people are living. International financial institutions can assist in positive development, but it is the governments themselves that must prepare the groundwork for this assistance and investment by rooting out corruption, ensuring adherence to the rule of law, and creating transparent mechanisms for developing natural resources and dealing with the revenue that such activities generate.

President George welcomed efforts to devote more attention within the OSCE to security as well as to economic and environmental issues in Central Asia. At the same time, he emphasized that such attention must not come at the expense of the human dimension, which encompasses a wide variety of issues from free and fair elections to combating trafficking in human beings. President George concluded by expressing his sincere belief that a frank and open dialogue will lead to a better understanding of “where we stand and how we can move forward together toward ensuring a greater level of security in the trans-Asian dimension of the OSCE”.

**Nursultan Nazarbaev,  
President of Kazakhstan**

In welcoming the participants to the Forum, President Nazarbaev noted that it was the first time that OSCE parliamentarians have gathered to discuss European security in a city 2000 kilometers from the geographical borders of Europe. He stated that this was justified, firstly, because of the globalization of economic, political and cultural processes, secondly, because of the role of Central Asia as a link between European and Asian systems of security, and thirdly, because of the need for dialogue between countries and peoples.



Mr. Nazarbaev continued by agreeing with the logic of devoting attention to the trans-Asian dimension of the OSCE. First of all, there are eleven OSCE participating States geographically located in Asia. Secondly, numerous factors point to Asia as an important area for promoting security on a global level. Finally, because of the extreme disparities in economic, political and cultural levels of countries on the continent, Asia deserves more attention. Furthermore, he noted that the roots of many threats to global security are in the Asian part of the planet.

President Nazarbaev further pointed out that Central Asia is undergoing a transformation on three levels. First, these countries are going through a transition from traditional to modern societies based on liberal principles. Secondly, the countries in the region have virtually had to begin the building of national institutions from scratch. Finally, they all endured the difficult process of transformation from planned to market-based economies and from one-party systems to elected governments based on political pluralism.

In terms of regional security, the countries in the region must consider relations with their large neighbours - Russia and China - as well as the cultural gravitation of the Islamic world. As a result, the President noted that the Central Asian security framework has been constructed on numerous levels. As such, there is not one dominant security organization in the region, but rather many, including the

OSCE, the Organization of the Collective Security Agreement, the Shanghai Co-operation Organization, the Conference on Interaction and Confidence Building Measures in Asia, and NATO's Partnership for Peace programme, to name just a few.

### **Oralbai Abdykarimov, Speaker of the Senate of Kazakhstan**

Mr. Abdykarimov began his remarks by thanking the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly for its initiative in organizing the Forum and for choosing Kazakhstan to host it. He felt that this was indicative of the close relationship between Kazakhstan and the OSCE and of the trust that has developed between them. He further noted that Kazakhstan, due to its location in Central Asia, a region plagued by numerous security threats, is well aware of the need for a more effective system of regional security. Central Asia therefore has much to contribute to discussions within the OSCE on European security. Mr. Abdykarimov also expressed the view that this Forum would give further impetus to the various organizations that have developed over the years to advance regional security.

Citing the proverb that it is better to visit a country once than to hear many things about it, he expressed his hope that the participants would make use of this opportunity to better understand the rich history of the region and of recent developments in Almaty and the Almaty region. Mr. Abdykarimov concluded by stating that this Forum would further the dialogue within the OSCE between its European and Asian components.





**Zhamarkhan Tuyakbai, Speaker of the Majilis of Kazakhstan**

Mr. Tuyakbai began by welcoming the participants to Almaty, and expressed the readiness of the Parliament of Kazakhstan to fulfill the responsibility it has undertaken in hosting the Forum. He expressed his hope that the upcoming discussions held in the framework of the Forum would contribute to closer relations between participating States.

He proceeded to point out that for Kazakhstan, active participation in the OSCE process has been a foreign policy priority. Other priorities of the country's leadership include pursuing economic reforms, striving to promote greater political pluralism and respect for human rights as well as dealing with the threat of terrorism. Because developments in each of these areas must proceed with their foundations in law, legislators have an important role to play. At present, the Parliament of Kazakhstan is working on legislation related to the criminal code, the ombudsman, and on elections, to name just a few areas of focus.

Finally, Mr. Tuyakbai noted that the fight against terrorism has also received considerable attention, and stated that parliamentarians can contribute to this fight through the dialogue they engage in and the partnerships they form with one another. A number of regional security organizations have been established and he stressed that parliamentary diplomacy can enhance and contribute to the effectiveness of these organizations.



**Jan Kubiš,  
OSCE Secretary General**

Secretary General Kubiš stated that the OSCE, with its co-operative and comprehensive approach to security, its Centres in all five Central Asian participating States, its active institutions - ODIHR, HCNM and RFM, and its parliamentary dimension - is well placed for its key role in assisting the Central Asian countries in their state-building, democratic and market-oriented reform processes and in strengthening their civil societies. The 2003 Netherlands Chairmanship-in-Office has identified co-operation with Central Asia as one of the OSCE priorities and this year the participating States provided the five OSCE Centres in Central Asia with increased human and financial resources. The Secretary General stressed that this does not mean a reduction of the OSCE's attention and activities in the human dimension, but rather reinforcement of work in the first two dimensions. Mr. Kubiš continued by giving an overview of developments since the accession of the five Central Asian countries to the OSCE in 1992. According to the Secretary General, most of the Central Asian states have been consistently working for democratic reforms and development of their societies, although not without occasional breakdowns and reversals. Looking to the future, Ambassador Kubiš saw good prospects for further interaction of the Central Asian States with and within the OSCE, recognizing that the OSCE and its instruments can only succeed when the OSCE works in partnership with the Central Asian countries, which requires that the governments themselves honour their OSCE commitments.







**Fikret Akcura, UNDP Resident Representative in Kazakhstan**

Mr. Akcura welcomed the Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum as a unique event in bringing together representatives of the parliaments from the trans-Asian region for the first time in history to discuss issues of strengthening security and stability in the region. He recalled that the UNDP works in close partnership with the OSCE and other international organizations on issues important to parliamentary democracy such as constitutional reform, elections,

capacity building for legislators and legislative staff, and increasing the participation of civil society. Mr. Akcura noted the striking amount of progress made during the past decade in the global transition to parliamentary democracy; ninety percent of the world's countries now have legislatures, over sixty percent are multi-party democracies, and the proportion of countries rated as free has more than doubled since 1990. Many of the obstacles facing the trans-Asian nations can be eased through economic stimulation drawing them closer into international trade. Similarly, a good deal of democratic transition can be achieved by engaging them in fora like the Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum, as well as by providing generous training to the young parliaments and governmental institutions. At the same time, Mr. Akcura emphasized the necessity to recognize that cultural transformation alongside nation-building requires much time if it is to be sustainable following seventy years of Soviet domination. Undue speed can only lead to superficial structures that are unlikely to withstand real challenges and could undermine dedication to the principles of democracy and market economics. Mr. Akcura concluded by expressing his confidence that all parliamentary delegations had come to Almaty driven by the desire to ensure peace and stability in the region and to discuss the means that would facilitate the settlement of old conflicts and prevent the occurrence of new ones.



## FIRST SESSION

*THE FIGHT AGAINST TERRORISM: SUCCESSES AND LINGERING THREATS TO THE REGION*

**Chair: Tone Tingsgaard,  
MP, Sweden**

Mrs. Tone Tingsgaard, Head of the Swedish Delegation, opened the session by noting the important role of parliamentarians in the fight against terrorism. She emphasized the importance of having members of parliament participate in international seminars and meetings in order to obtain new information and inspiration for domestic parliamentary decisions, which help guide activities undertaken by national governments.

**Lynn Pascoe, US Deputy Assistant  
Secretary of State for European  
and Eurasian Affairs**

Mr. Pascoe began his speech by emphasizing the importance of focusing discussions on security in the 21st century rather than becoming trapped by the superficial use of the 19th century concepts that produced the chaos of the 20th century. Instead, security in modern times is provided by: 1) prosperity through integration into the global economy; 2) popular participation by the people through a system of democratic governance; and 3) regional and global co-operation to manage disputes and eliminate common threats. In short, success in the modern world depends on co-operation rather than confrontation; open economies rather than closed borders; political pluralism rather



than autocratic rule; and participation in the global economy, rather than isolation or autarkic economic strategies.

According to Mr. Pascoe, the Central Asian States have made significant progress in establishing statehood and laying the foundations for economic progress, in addition to working to resolve outstanding disputes with each other and with surrounding countries. In this respect he specifically mentioned the settlement of the century-old border disagreements with China and delimitation of Caspian maritime boundaries. Mr. Pascoe continued by elaborating on external threats to the countries of Central Asia, including terrorism and religious extremism as well as trafficking in narcotics and persons. Dealing with such threats requires regional co-operation, which unfortunately remains quite weak, and according to Mr. Pascoe this is one area that must be made a priority by the Central Asian States. He furthermore emphasized that the greatest threat to the stability of the Central Asian region is internal: survival for the governments and the well-being of its people depends on economic and political transformation into modern states. As examples he mentioned that energy and other natural resources must be managed efficiently and without corruption, and exported through multiple pipelines to obtain maximum wealth for the people. Income should be used to develop strong and diversified economies that provide employment for the population and dynamism for economic development. Agriculture must



be modernized to make the fertile fields of Central Asia globally competitive, and market reform is necessary to promote the industrial and commercial base essential for the long-term viability of the region. Finally, political reforms leading to genuine democracies and providing administrative and judicial systems free of corruption form the foundation for the development of modern societies.

Mr. Pascoe concluded by expressing his opinion that development in the region must have two prime ingredients in order to succeed: 1) political will by the leaders of the region to undertake urgently needed political and economic reforms and to strengthen regional co-operation; and 2) assistance from the international community - both states and international organizations - to develop the institutions and practices necessary for this transformation.

### **Kasymzhomart Tokaev, Foreign Minister of Kazakhstan**

Mr. Tokaev began by stressing the role of parliaments in defining national security interests, which in the case of Kazakhstan are heavily linked to its geopolitical situation. He welcomed the Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum as a unique opportunity for parliamentary dialogue on regional and international threats in Central Asia.

The Minister emphasized that Kazakhstan supports the international fight against terrorism and stressed the need to continue a hard line in this fight. Mr. Tokaev urged the international community to promote an open and frank discussion of terrorism and not to confuse the debate by using emotional or religious notions. He emphasized the need



to promote inter-religious dialogue in order to avoid increasing mistrust between different religious communities. Mr. Tokaev brought participants' attention to the clear connection between poverty and support for terrorist organizations. He called for more attention to be given to building greater social balance, particularly in Afghanistan, where the current situation is unstable. He expressed concern that poor people may be forced to commit terrorist actions in order to survive, and urged that a distinction be made between those who merely take orders and the real terrorists. In addition, Mr. Tokaev highlighted problems related to drug trafficking and border control and their links to terrorism, and appealed to the UN and the OSCE to give urgent attention to these issues. He expressed concern that despite national and regional efforts, drug trafficking in Central Asia is on the rise. Mr. Tokaev stressed the need to reform the UN in order to increase its effectiveness, and also



emphasized that the OSCE should reform its work to ensure a better balance between the three baskets defined in the Helsinki Final Act. The Foreign Minister urged the OSCE to strengthen the Action Plan on terrorism and to conduct a survey of participating States' attitude towards the fight against terrorism in order to promote transparency in this matter.

**Shavkad Ismailov, Chair of the  
Committee on Defence, Parliament  
of Tajikistan**



In his presentation, Mr. Ismailov explained how the emergence of a new international system has influenced the security situation in Central Asia, and has led to new security threats all over the world. He stressed that the increase in the production of weapons of mass destruction not only puts millions of peoples' lives at risk, but that it also poses a threat to the environment of the whole planet. In addition, Mr. Ismailov noted the danger of an increased emergence of regional conflicts as a consequence of disagreements over religion, race and ideology. Furthermore, he emphasized the increased threat of terrorism and extremism and urged a strong international fight against terrorism, and illegal trafficking in drugs and weapons as well as organized crime. He mentioned enhanced international intelligence sharing as one important step forward in countering these threats. Mr. Ismailov also stressed the danger that the widening gap between rich and poor may cause demographic problems.

Mr. Ismailov noted that although terrorism did not start on 11 September 2001, the tragic events

in the USA did make terrorism more visible. He expressed regret that the Islamic element of the conflict in Afghanistan did not result in greater dialogue between religions or civilizations, but rather caused further alienation. Mr. Ismailov urged the international community to assist Afghanistan, while avoiding direct interference. Mr. Ismailov emphasized that economic problems, social imbalance, and a lack of employment prospects for young people are extremely dangerous elements in the present situation in Afghanistan, and that they could lead to increased tension in the area. He therefore urged the international community, and in particular the UN, to assist with building infrastructure and with promoting training and education. Mr. Ismailov also stressed the need for economic assistance to the Afghan people and noted that promoting agricultural development is one way to ease tension and assist the ordinary people who are suffering from the current situation. At the same time, he urged the international community to open up markets in order to give developing countries a chance to develop their economies. Mr. Ismailov continued by explaining that there is a link between the trafficking of drugs through Central Asia and the financing of terrorist organizations, and stressed the need for increased border monitoring in Tajikistan and the rest of Central Asia to stop this flow. He regretted the fact that border control is not currently effective in stopping the trafficking in drugs, and asked for international assistance to strengthen it.

### **Discussion**

In the ensuing debate there was discussion regarding the relationship between the openness of governments and the threat stemming from terrorism. In this connection, speakers strongly emphasized the importance of continuing democratic reforms and fighting terrorism in parallel. It was also highlighted that in modern democracies, media outlets have an important responsibility in that they present images of society - it is important that populations are informed in a balanced way about the complexities surrounding the issue of terrorism. The issue of financing of terrorism was also discussed; several participants stressed the need to stop the flow of money to terrorist organizations by improving financial intelligence and by sharing this internationally.



SUNDAY, 8 JUNE 2003

**SECOND SESSION***THE ECONOMY AND THE ENVIRONMENT: THE LINK TO LONG-TERM SECURITY*

**Chair: Maria Santos,  
MP, Portugal**

Ms. Santos opened the Second Session of the Forum by underlining the political importance of economic and environmental concerns to long-term security. Economic and environmental issues, which form the 'second basket' of the OSCE, are two pillars of the new paradigm of development.

She continued by stating that the need for balanced integration of economic, social, and environmental objectives is both a priority and an important challenge for our societies, especially following the 2002 Johannesburg Summit. Today more than ever, it is necessary to move from bland statements to specific actions in order to confirm our commitments to protecting the environment, facilitating economic growth, fighting poverty, and preventing conflicts.

Ms. Santos concluded her remarks by referring to the important initiatives being carried out by the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly, such as the Sub-Regional Conference on developing Small and Medium-Sized Enterprises held in Bern, which helped raise awareness of the importance of small enterprises in economic development.

**Kairat Kelimbetov, Minister of  
Economy and Budget Planning of  
Kazakhstan**

The Minister emphasized that Kazakhstan has good possibilities for successful development of the national economy and its integration into the world community. The most important source of Kazakhstan's future economic growth, sustainable development and effective integration into the international economic system are the country's abundant mineral resources.

Minister Kelimbetov explained that Kazakhstan is a country with extensive farming areas. The agricultural sector is one of the key elements of the country's economy, and Kazakhstan is a major producer of marketable grain, meat and wool. Kazakhstan has embarked upon agricultural sector restructuring through the establishment of new corporate entities and privatization. This is based upon the successful experiences of several other countries that have used the same strategy to create a strong, privately-owned agricultural sector. Private ownership is now the dominant economic mechanism for agricultural production.

Further development of the country's local industries and natural resources will help Kazakhstan to achieve its enormous economic potential, overcome





current development difficulties and will place it economically among leading countries of the world.

Despite the fact that Kazakhstan has the highest GDP in the region, fighting poverty remains one of the country's biggest challenges. The Minister described the government's programmes to fight poverty by means of promoting employment, education, training and assistance. He also referred to the importance of transparency in the activities of State bodies as a way of promoting economic growth.

**Alexander Carius, Director of  
Adelphi Reserach**



In his presentation, Mr. Carius presented the Environment Agenda for Security and Co-operation in Europe (ENVSEC). This programme, launched in 2002 by the OSCE, the UNDP, and the UNEP, is a process whereby these three leading political,

development and environmental organizations mobilize efforts around shared environmental concerns as a means for strengthening good governance and reducing tensions within and between countries.

The key concepts of ENVSEC are promoting sustainable resource management and environmental co-operation in the interest of ensuring peace and stability. The initiative strives to promote the use of environmental management strategies to reduce insecurity in Southeastern Europe and Central Asia. So far the initiative has produced two regional environmental security assessments, for Southeastern Europe and Central Asia. The initiative currently represents a total of nine countries in Southeastern Europe and five in Central Asia.

Environmental degradation is one of biggest problems currently facing Central Asian States. Issues such as water supply and contamination, industrial and radioactive waste, soil degradation, desertification and erosion all require a co-ordinated response. The link between environmental degradation and conflict is clear; environmental and socio-economic challenges accumulate in certain localities, posing a risk to human security and national stability. While environmental degradation and resource scarcity have not been the lone causes of violent conflict, environmental stress may trigger tensions in already marginalized areas.

The road ahead - a three year project - will be clustered around three pillars: vulnerability assessment and monitoring; policy development and implementation; and capacity building and institutional development.





**Victor Dukhovny, Director of the Scientific-Information Centre of the Interstate Co-ordination Water Commission of Central Asia**

Mr. Dukhovny addressed the important issue of water resources. He stressed that it is impossible to divide the natural-climatic and water-ecological prosperity of the planet into political and administrative boundaries. Inter-state co-operation in Central Asia is therefore of paramount importance in order to deal with such issues.

The Aral Sea, located in south-western Kazakhstan and north-western Uzbekistan, was formerly the fourth largest lake in the world; it has no outlet. During recent years, no water has reached the Aral Sea due to mismanagement of water resources. As a result, the Aral's volume has dropped nearly

70% since 1960. In 1994, the five riparian nations of the Aral Sea Basin, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan, and Uzbekistan, agreed to work toward managing and restoring the resources of the Aral Sea.

The Water Resources Management Training Project in the Aral Sea Basin started on March 2000. The goal of this five-year project is to promote good governance and environmental sustainability in the Aral Sea basin through the development of a water resources training network and long-term international co-operation in policy, management and operations levels. This project envisions a combination of study tours, seminars, courses, and train-the-trainer programmes aimed at increasing the capacity of water management professionals.

### Discussion

The addresses by the three keynote speakers were followed by a debate with interventions by participants from a number of countries, who strongly stressed that economic development and environmental protection in Central Asia are essential elements in the stability of the region. All sectors of society have a key role to play in building a future in which resources are protected and prosperity and health are within reach for all citizens. Furthermore, it was emphasized that in addition to efforts by governments, the participation of civil society (businesses and industry, local authorities, NGOs, and scientific and technological communities) in these processes is essential. The role of the OSCE and of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly was underlined as important in ensuring that economic and environmental issues are fully linked to security.





## THIRD SESSION

### *THE DEVELOPMENT OF DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS: STEPPING STONE TO REGIONAL SECURITY*



**Chair: Zhabaikhhan Abdildin,  
MP, Kazakhstan**

Mr. Abdildin opened the Session by pointing out that all governments worry about security. He noted that in the past, it may have seemed sufficient to guarantee security by developing an army, police and other such institutions. However, as societies advance, it becomes more and more evident that security can only be truly guaranteed through the development of democratic principles, such as respect for human rights, free and fair elections and a free media. Mr. Abdildin proceeded to introduce the speakers in the Session.

#### **Alexander Veshnyakov, Chairman of the Russian Central Election Commission**

Mr. Veshnyakov opened his remarks by noting that trust in elections is a prerequisite for trust in elected authorities. Election campaigns offer an opportunity to become acquainted with a variety of political views, as well as to enhance freedom of the media, exchange views with voters, and to thereby determine methods to respond to their criticisms and suggestions. True democracies are constantly developing and require a regular exchange of information

and experience. As can be observed, even 'mature' democracies encounter difficulties in electoral processes.

Mr. Veshnyakov continued with a few remarks about the Russian electoral framework, which is being updated to accommodate the upcoming parliamentary and presidential elections in December 2003 and March 2004 respectively. Changes are being introduced to enhance political pluralism as well as the role of the regions and of political parties, and to limit the possibility of using administrative resources in the election campaign.

In terms of international standards for free and fair elections, Mr. Veshnyakov noted that a number of documents have been produced over the years, particularly in the last ten years, but that these don't yet form a complete system. As a result, the countries of the Commonwealth of Independent States and the countries of Central and Eastern Europe are in the process of preparing a Convention on the conduct of free and democratic elections. While recognizing the importance of OSCE and Council of Europe documents, which often come in the form of recommendations, Mr. Veshnyakov stressed that such a Convention would be signed and ratified by the participating States and would thus take on an obligatory nature, thereby increasing adherence to democratic principles in the conduct of elections.





**Ahmet Tan, Journalist (Aksam),  
former Vice-President of  
the OSCE PA**

Mr. Tan began his presentation by summarizing the importance of free media. For a society to be considered truly democratic there needs to be a high degree of protection accorded to the expression of ideas in published form, whether the medium be newspapers, magazines, books, pamphlets, motion pictures, television or most recently, the internet. Mass media contributes to identity formation and common understanding, as well as to supplying the necessary information for citizens to consciously participate in democratic life. The media has a fundamental role to play as society's watchdog. Without free media, corrupt practices in economic and political life as well as non-transparent policy decisions are unlikely to be exposed and remedied. Mr. Tan continued by noting that free expression has never been and is even today not absolutely guaranteed in any society. Threats to free expression come not

only from countries where journalists are murdered or intimidated, but equally from those where media concentration threatens diversity. Mr. Tan emphasized that the liberalization of once closed economies does not ensure the liberalization of the media. Societies in transition that develop a more vibrant civil society, with large numbers of organizations advocating human rights and free expression are likely to help shape a post-authoritarian culture of democracy in which the right of free expression becomes a key value. Other basic preconditions for free media and free expression include a national commitment to the Freedom of Expression Article of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, an institutional framework to which infringements of free expression can be appealed, a democratic culture honouring free expression, independent regulatory agencies that can impose sanctions on broadcast entities that fail to offer fairly balanced programming or that incite hatred, as well as press councils, a public broadcasting system, and organizations of journalists dedicated to promoting and protecting free expression. Mr. Tan underlined the fact that freedom of expression and media has been a guiding principle in most democracies in the OSCE region since the adoption of the Helsinki Final Act. He noted that freedom of the media and of expression can be an early warning indicator for conflict prevention; any restrictions on the right to freedom of expression can lead to tensions. In this respect Mr. Tan also noted that the creation in 1997 of the OSCE's Representative on Freedom of the Media was due to the recognition that the security of OSCE participating States cannot be separated from issues of press freedom. Finally, Mr. Tan drew attention to the OSCE Prize for Journalism and Democracy, which is awarded annually by the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly to support courageous and professional journalism. According to Mr. Tan, this is an important mechanism for keeping media freedom at the top of the OSCE agenda.





**Christian Strohal, Director of the OSCE Office of Democratic Institutions and Human Rights**

Mr. Strohal opened his speech by stating that the protection of human rights is a cornerstone for developing a stable and secure society and that national human rights systems lie at the very heart of effective human rights protection. He emphasized that the role of parliaments in such systems cannot be overstated. They translate international standards into national reality through legislation, control over implementation and through interaction with civil society. He then gave an overview of specific issues with which parliamentarians in the region are dealing and where the ODIHR can contribute: ombudsman institutions, freedom of the media, rule of law, gender equality, trafficking and terrorism. In Central Asia, the ODIHR has supported the authorities in Kazakhstan and Kyrgyzstan in the establishment of Ombudsman offices. In Uzbekistan, the ODIHR assisted the Ombudsman office in upgrading operational capacities in its central and regional offices. The ODIHR has also generated programmes to consolidate the rule of law, such as a roundtable in Almaty on a draft law on NGOs, and the review of Kyrgyzstan's law on the organization of and participation in demonstrations. Regarding gender equality, Mr. Strohal mentioned that the Women's Rights Awareness training project, launched in 2000 in Kazakhstan, has created a strong team of local trainers who have conducted several

hundred seminars all over Kazakhstan. On the eve of local elections and elections to the Parliament in 2004, this project will assist women in their preparations and effective participation in the electoral process. Mr. Strohal also discussed trafficking in human beings, and stressed that there is a compelling need for clearer guidance on how to identify a trafficked victim, investigate related crimes and co-ordinate assistance. Mr. Strohal closed his speech by reflecting on the balance between state security and human rights protection in the fight against terrorism and by stating that any strategy to prevent and combat terrorism must have human rights at its heart; violating human rights in the fight against terrorism is self-defeating and counter-productive. The development of strong national human rights systems can only serve to strengthen the fight against terrorism.

**Willem Hendrik de Beaufort, Secretary General of the Netherlands House of Representatives**



Mr. De Beaufort introduced himself as a firm believer in parliamentary democracy as a principle that can be applied in all cultures and traditions. Parliamentary democracy is accompanied by many misunderstandings, much confusion and at times even outright chaos, but at the same time it increases prosperity and enables people to live together more or less in peace. In his address, he mentioned some ways of improving the functioning of parliamentary democracy and thus reducing chaos and disorder by

discussing the electoral system, the legislative process, scrutiny of the executive and the legal status of members of parliament.

Mr. De Beaufort expressed his conviction that elections are necessary not only to produce a parliament but also for ensuring the health of a society. Elections oblige not only political parties and candidates, but also the citizens of a country to reflect on the important issues confronting them. The Secretary General underlined that if elections are to have this educational effect, the campaign must be conducted in complete freedom and the expression of all views, including more radical and extreme views, must be permitted. All stages of the election process must be honest and transparent, and in this connection Mr. De Beaufort praised the exceptional usefulness of OSCE election monitoring programmes and the indispensable participation of parliamentarians in election observation. Expression of all views at elections is also necessary to ensure that a parliament subsequently has an opposition in its midst, preferably in the form of more than one opposition party. He also noted that it is better to admit people with radical and even extreme ideas to parliament and allow them to participate in the parliamentary debate rather than to banish them to the street or force them underground. Regarding pre-conditions for good legislation, Mr. De Beaufort emphasized the necessity of having sufficient parliamentary staff, as well as rules on the registration of political lobbyists, free press and a large degree of transparency in all respects, including the publication of draft laws and amendments. The Secretary General continued by discussing parliamentary instruments of scrutiny of the executive, such as the right to approve the budget, written questions, public committee meetings and motions of no-confidence. Mr. De Beau-

fort considered the written question to be a highly effective instrument since the individual members of parliament have the opportunity to formulate their positions very precisely without encountering limitations on speaking time. He therefore recommended that this power be created for parliamentarians in the so-called new democracies. Mr. De Beaufort concluded his contribution by reflecting on the legal status of members of parliament. In his view, the minimum constitutional safeguard necessary is immunity against criminal prosecution for things a member of parliament says, writes, or does while acting in that capacity. Additionally, the substantive aspects of membership of parliament, such as individual income, must be properly regulated, preferably in an act of parliament.

## Discussion

During the course of the ensuing discussion, several questions were posed to the Speakers. Questions touched upon the relationship between the President and the Parliament in the Russian Federation, the advantages and disadvantages of a proportional versus majoritarian electoral system, the need for an election code, and the extent to which history and culture should be a part of the discussion on human rights principles.

Several participants also took the floor to present their views on the subjects presented by the Speakers. Among themes discussed were the relationship of the Council of Europe towards Central Asian States, the development of human rights mechanisms in Kyrgyzstan, and the importance of the relationship between media freedom and democracy.





## CLOSING SESSION

### CONCLUSIONS AND STEPS FORWARD

Prior to President George's Concluding Statement, a number of delegates took the opportunity of the Closing Session of the Forum to give their impressions of the discussions of the previous two days. One delegate underlined the need for greater regional co-operation in Central Asia, particularly in the fields of nuclear waste storage and water issues, and praised the positive impact that the Forum would have on international co-operation. Another speaker stressed that this Forum indicates the importance of the Central Asian region to the OSCE; and while noting that the OSCE aims at joint action, he stressed that primary responsibility for progress in the region rests with the Central Asian peoples and governments. Several parliamentarians from Partner for Co-operation States took the floor; the close connection between security in Central Asia and in other regions was noted, and in this

connection, the possibility of assistance by the OSCE PA in finding solutions to security threats outside of the OSCE region was raised. Several speakers urged continued and improved co-operation between the OSCE PA and OSCE governmental structures; both the OSCE and the OSCE PA's increasing emphasis on regional security co-operation in Central Asia was applauded. Given the proximity of Afghanistan, a number of speakers addressed concerns arising from changes happening there; the importance of addressing the root causes of terrorism was a recurring theme in discussions, and several speakers urged the creation of a global convention on terrorism. Noting that violations of human rights lead to greater radicalism, the importance of respecting freedom of the media, and strengthening the rule of law and democracy was also stressed.



## FINAL STATEMENT BY THE PRESIDENT

### **The Trans-Asian Dimension of the OSCE: A Vital Security Link**

Bruce GEORGE (MP, United Kingdom)  
President of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly

Mr. Speaker,

Distinguished colleagues,

Ladies and Gentlemen,

Let me close this Forum by making the following concluding remarks on the themes we have discussed during the past two days.

Central Asia is a region with enormous assets, particularly in its resilient people and, in parts, its natural resources. Yet it has been bequeathed massive problems that we have been hearing about in detail these last few days. There are formidable obstacles to economic, social and political development, yet they are not insurmountable. The brief checklist includes:

- Terrorism and religious extremism;
- Devastating environmental difficulties with shrinking seas, polluted rivers, dumping of radioactive wastes;
- Trafficking of arms and drugs;
- Poverty and social upheaval;
- Acute problems for governments;
- Inadequacies in human rights;
- The search of external powers for advantage – a modern updating of the infamous “Great Game.”

I think it is safe to say that terrorism remains one of the most serious threats to long-term security in the OSCE region, and Central Asia is no exception. We should be prepared that the fight against this most heinous phenomenon will undoubtedly continue for some time to come. We must be aware that this fight is not just about reacting to terrorist acts, but more importantly about understanding and addressing the roots of terrorism, as Minister Tokaev stressed in his presentation during the first session. In this connection, we need to constantly assess the methods we are using in the fight against terrorism and remain ever so vigilant about the dangerous tendency to limit people’s rights in the effort to enhance security. Limitations in fundamental freedoms and human rights in exchange for greater security is not a sacrifice we should be willing to make.

While national governments will bear the greatest burden in the fight against terrorism, we must support efforts to increase cooperation between States and within multi-lateral organisations, like the OSCE. Parliamentarians can play an important role by seeking to coordinate and push through legislation essential to the fight against terrorism, by ensuring close oversight of the actions of our governments and, when necessary, calling them to account when they overstep their boundaries. I fully agree with several of the speakers of yesterday, as for instance Ambassador Pascoe, who emphasized the need to stop the flow of financial means to terrorist organisations. We should be much more aggressive in addressing the financial basis of terrorist

## Final Statement

organisations. Greater work in fighting organised crime and trafficking in drugs and arms as well as the development of systems to share intelligence on bank and financial information at a regional and international level would have a significant impact on this field.

Close international contacts are all the more important because of the inextricable links between security in individual States and in the region as a whole. As Mr. Ismailov from Tajikistan emphasized yesterday, it was hard to envision long-term security in Central Asia as long as there was turmoil in Afghanistan. Though genuine stability and prosperity in Afghanistan is still a distant prospect, it is now possible to imagine that, with the concerted effort and assistance of the international community, peace and democracy are possible there. This will of course contribute to greater chances for long-term security in neighbouring States. In connection with the new partnership between the OSCE and Afghanistan, the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly declares its readiness to work actively with a parliamentary body which may emerge there.

Dear colleagues,

Some economies in the region, including Kazakhstan, have experienced growth in recent years, although such positive tendencies are still heavily overshadowed by the economic hardships felt by most citizens. Economic recovery and longer-term prosperity will only be possible following economic reform on a variety of levels. Close cooperation with economic financial institutions can be most helpful in that regard. An issue of importance for the OSCE - good governance - should also be of paramount significance to Members of Parliament who could play a greater role in addressing the damaging long-term effects of pervasive corruption on the economies of the region.

While the economic aspects of the OSCE's second basket seem to hold our attention the most, we must not lose sight of the link between the economy and the environment. The human consequences alone of environmental degradation are staggering; if we add to the equation the negative effects on the economy, then environmental issues must take a higher place on our parliamentary agendas. As with security and economics, environmental issues – among them the shared use of water – can often be of a trans-border nature and must therefore be tackled in cooperation with other countries and with assistance from international organisations. As discussed in detail during the second session of our Conference the current co-operation between the OSCE and the UN in programmes to fight environmental degradation is an important precedent. Economic issues are directly linked to the well-being of our citizens. Minister Kelimbetov clearly referred this morning to the important challenges faced by Kazakhstan in fighting poverty. This fight is being progressively tackled by means of education and training among others. We must not forget that security in our continent is ultimately linked to economic prosperity and environmental stability.

Dear colleagues,

While all these issues need to be high on our list of priorities, I'm sure you will agree that, as Members of Parliament, there is another thing which is never far from our thoughts – elections. In this connection, I think it is worth to reiterate an important point made by Mr. Veshnyakov, who highlighted the relationship between the nature of elections and the level of trust in the authorities. In regard to the last cycle of parliamentary elections in Central Asia assessments varied, although there seemed to be general agreement that they fell short of international standards for free and fair elections. The next parliamentary elections which will take place in most countries of the region in the next few years can be a unique opportunity to improve on these shortcomings. For this to happen, it is important that the necessary political will be exhibited to hold inclusive elections that give an equal and unhindered chance to all political forces in the country. As for improvements in the electoral framework, the CIS Convention on democratic election standards seems to be a positive step in that direction.

## Final Statement

The Parliamentary Assembly is ready to assist and would ultimately like to be able to send parliamentary observers should the minimum requirements be met. I think it goes without saying that among those requirements are a free media, which is of the utmost importance in election campaigns, but more generally, as Mr. Tan so rightly noted, serves to advance democracy and long-term security. Political pluralism, freedom of association, and respect for human rights are also integral parts of the electoral and democratisation processes, as more than one of our distinguished speakers have noted. Although governments don't like to hear the criticism they inevitably will receive from opposition parties and NGOs, it is that feedback which helps our societies develop in the right direction.

Ultimately, it is also important that the end goal be election to a parliamentary body which has real oversight functions and genuine powers vis-à-vis the government. Mr. de Beaufort noted the challenges of parliamentary democracy, although I would certainly agree with his conclusion (and that of Winston Churchill) that we have not yet found a better alternative. In any case, while in every country the relationship between the government and the parliament differs, there must be a certain minimum of oversight functions for the parliament if a genuine balance of power is to be guaranteed.

Ladies and gentlemen,

There are so many governments and institutions, private and public, who are seeking to assist. High amongst these are our Parliamentary Assembly and the OSCE. The region is assuming more attention, but more is needed in the way of intellectual input, policy, and resources. It would be really helpful to prioritise and evaluate how successful our endeavours have been thus far. It would be even more helpful if other organisations pursuing a similar path were to examine where co-ordination and co-operation might be refined and enhanced.

The region has for over two millennia been a link between Asia and Europe. It has been the route by which the continents have traded, yet the same ease of access has facilitated the march of armies and regimes seeking to impose their world view. The region has been a centre of civilization and scholarship. It has a long and rich, yet turbulent and difficult past. It has made considerable contributions to our world and will give more and more in the future.

Dear colleagues,

I am most pleased to have been involved in the debates of the past few days. As a relative "newcomer" to the region, I have truly been enlightened by the discussions in this room as well as those which I was able to have in the corridors with individual participants in this Forum. Since the main goal of this Forum has been to raise awareness and increase parliamentary dialogue on issues of security in the trans-Asian dimension of the OSCE, I can assure you that it has been a success for me. I hope you can all say the same for yourselves. Of course, the discussions we have undertaken are just a beginning and I sincerely hope that they can be continued at the Second Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum.

In closing, I would once again like to express my gratitude for the generosity of the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan. They have received us all here in Almaty with such wonderful hospitality and I believe we can expect that to continue at tonight's reception and tomorrow's excursion.

Thank you for your attention.



**OSCE PA TRANS-ASIAN PARLIAMENTARY FORUM**  
**‘THE TRANS-ASIAN DIMENSION OF THE OSCE: A VITAL SECURITY LINK’**

Almaty, Kazakhstan, 7-9 June 2003

Programme

**Saturday, 7 June**

**13:00 OPENING SESSION: TEN YEARS OF NATION AND INSTITUTION BUILDING:  
LESSONS LEARNED**

Welcoming remarks:

Mr. Bruce George, President of the OSCE PA  
Mr. Oralbai Abdykarimov, Speaker of the Senate of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
Mr. Zhamarkhan Tuyakbai, Speaker of the Majlis of the Republic of Kazakhstan  
Mr. Fikret Akcura, UNDP Resident Representative in Kazakhstan

Addresses:

Mr. Nursultan Nazarbaev, President of Kazakhstan  
Mr. Jan Kubis, OSCE Secretary General

14:30 Coffee Break

**15:00 SESSION 1: THE FIGHT AGAINST TERRORISM: SUCCESSES AND LINGERING  
THREATS TO THE REGION**

Chair: Ms. Tone Tingsgård, Head of the Swedish Delegation to the OSCE PA

***Security in Central Asia: regional or international threat?***

Speaker: Mr. Lynn Pascoe, Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for European and Eurasian Affairs,  
U.S. State Department

***The role of regional co-operation initiatives***

Speaker: Mr. Kasymzhomart Tokaev, Secretary of State - Foreign Minister of Kazakhstan

***The effects on the region of political instability in Afghanistan***

Speaker: Mr. Shavkad Ismailov, Chair of the Committee on Defense, the Parliament of Tajikistan

***Interventions to be followed by discussion***

17:00 Session ends

18:00 Departure from the hotels for the Abaya Opera and Ballet Theatre

18:30 Concert in honor of the participants in the Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum

19:30 Buffet reception offered by the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan

**Sunday, 8 June**

**09:00 SESSION 2: THE ECONOMY AND THE ENVIRONMENT: THE LINK TO LONG-TERM  
SECURITY**

Chair: Ms. Maria Santos, Member of the Portuguese Delegation to the OSCE PA

***Economic development and poverty alleviation in the Central Asian countries; cooperation with international economic organizations***

Speaker: Mr. Kairat Kelimbetov, Minister of Economy and Budget Planning of Kazakhstan

***Addressing environmental concerns***

Speaker: Mr. Alexander Carius, Prof., Director of Adelphi Research

***The use of shared water resources***

Speaker: Mr. Victor Dukhovny, Director of the Scientific-Information Centre of the Interstate Coordination Water Commission of Central Asia

***Interventions to be followed by discussion***

11:00 Coffee break

11:30 **SESSION 3: THE DEVELOPMENT OF DEMOCRATIC INSTITUTIONS: STEPPING STONE TO REGIONAL SECURITY**

Chair: Mr. Zhabaikhon Abdildin, Member of the Kazakh Delegation

***Free and fair election processes***

Speaker: Mr. Alexander Veshnyakov, Chair of the CEC of the Russian Federation

***The role of free media in developing democracies***

Speaker: Mr. Ahmet Tan, Journalist (Aksam), former Vice-President of the OSCE PA

***The development of national human rights systems***

Speakers: Ambassador Christian Strohal, ODIHR Director, and Mr. Willem Hendrik de Beaufort, Secretary General of the Dutch House of Representatives

***Interventions to be followed by discussion***

13:30 Buffet lunch offered by the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Regent Almaty Hotel)

15:30 **CLOSING SESSION: CONCLUSIONS AND STEPS FORWARD**

Chair: President of the OSCE PA

***Remarks by Heads of Delegation***

***Remarks by the Head of the Kazakh Delegation***

***Concluding Statement by the President of the OSCE PA***

17:00 Session ends

18:00 Departure from the hotels for the State Museum of the Republic of Kazakhstan

18:30 Guided tour of the exhibits of the Museum

19:00 Buffet reception hosted by the Parliament of the Republic of Kazakhstan

**Monday, 9 June**

09:30 Departure from the Hotels for the Turgensky Gorge

10:30 Arrival at the trout breeding reserve

11:30 Departure for the "Stetson" Ranch

12:00 Arrival at the "Stetson" Ranch

12:30 Lunch

17:00 Departure for Almaty

18:00 Arrival at the hotels



FINAL LIST OF PARTICIPANTS  
Trans-Asian Parliamentary Forum  
Almaty, 7-9 June 2003

**Special Guests**

NAZARBAYEV, Nursultan (Mr)  
*President of Kazakhstan*  
ABDYKARIMOV, Oralbai (Mr)  
*Speaker of the Senate of Kazakhstan*  
TUYAKBAY, Zharmakhan (Mr)  
*Speaker of the Majilis of Kazakhstan*  
TOKAEV, Kasymzhomart (Mr)  
*Foreign Minister of Kazakhstan*

**Delegations**

**Azerbaijan**

**Member of Delegation**  
AIDYN, Mirzazade (Mr)  
GULIEV, Musa (Mr)

**Belarus**

MOROZOV, Vladimir (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
LIS, Svyatoslav (Mr)  
SINYAK, Eduard (Mr)

**Belgium**

JANSSENS, Charles (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Staff of Delegation**  
MYTTENAERE, Robert (Mr)  
*Secretary of Delegation*

**Bulgaria**

**Member of Delegation**  
PEYKOV, Tosho (Mr)  
DJAFEROV, Vladimir (Mr)

**Croatia**

**Member of Delegation**  
MILAS, Ivan (Mr)

**Staff of Delegation**

PETKOVIC, Milovan (Mr)  
*Secretary of Delegation*

**Cyprus**

EVAGOROU, Stavros (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
THEOCHAROUS, Eleni (Ms)

**Czech Republic**

SULAK, Petr (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
KARAS, Jiri (Mr)  
RUSOVA, Marie (Mrs)  
**Staff of Delegation**  
DOSTALOVA, Eva (Mrs)  
*Secretary of Delegation*

**Estonia**

ALLIK, Jaak (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Staff of Delegation**  
RÖNGELEP, Ene (Ms)  
*Secretary of Delegation*

**France**

**Member of Delegation**  
LEFORT, Jean-Claude (Mr)  
**Staff of Delegation**  
OUDOTTE, Delphine (Ms)

**Germany**

**Member of Delegation**  
RAIDEL, Hans (Mr)

**Hungary**

HARS, Gabor (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*

**Italy****Member of Delegation**

KESSLER, Giovanni (Mr)  
Mrs Kessler  
PISTELLI, Lapo (Mr)  
Mrs Pistelli

**Kazakhstan**

ABDYKARIMOV, Oralbai (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
*President of the Senate of Parliament of Kazakhstan*

**Member of Delegation****Senate**

BAIGELDY, Omirbek (Mr)  
*Vice-President of the Senate of Parliament of Kazakhstan*

ABDILDIN, Zhabaikhon (Mr)  
DOSMANBETOV, Bakbergen (Mr)  
SULTANOV, Kuanysh (Mr)  
TUREGELDINOV, Zhumabek (Mr)  
ZHEKSEMBINOV, Zhomartkali (Mr)

**Majilis**

TUYAKBAY, Zharmakhan (Mr)  
*President of the Majilis of Parliament of Kazakhstan*

KOPEYEV, Mukhambet (Mr)  
*Vice-President of the Majilis of Parliament of Kazakhstan*

BAINAZAROV, Galym (Mr)  
KALDYGULOVA, Saniya (Mrs)  
OMAROV, Sharip (Mr)  
TURYSSOV, Karatay (Mr)  
TROSHIKHIN, Mikhail (Mr)  
SYZDYKOV, Tito (Mr)  
ZHALYBIN, Sergey (Mr)

**Staff of Delegation**

NURPEISOVA, Gulnaz (Ms)

**Kyrgyzstan**

BULEKBAEV, Erkin (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
Mr Kanshlik Bulekbaev

**Member of Delegation**

BORUBAEV, Altai (Mr)  
*Speaker of the Peoples Representatives Assembly*  
ERKEBAEV, Abdygany (Mr)  
*Speaker of the Legislative Assembly*  
ABDIMOMUNOV, Alisher (Mr)  
KORKMAZOV, Hadjimurat (Mr)  
SABIROV, Alisher (Mr)  
IMANALIEV, Kanybek (Mr)  
SAMAKOV, Karganbek (Mr)  
Mr Nurbek Satvaldiev

**Staff of Delegation**

BAKETAEV, Bakyt (Mr)  
OMURZAKOV, K. (Mr)  
*Assistant*  
SAKYSHEV, (Mr)  
SOKOLENKO, (Mr)  
*Security*  
YOSIPENKO, Igor (Mr)  
*Security*  
Ms Zhanat Dzhumabaeva  
Ms Khabira Mazhieva

**Latvia****Member of Delegation**

KLEMENTJEVS, Andrejs (Mr)

**Norway****Member of Delegation**

NISTAD, Thore (Mr)

**Portugal****Member of Delegation**

SANTOS, Maria (Ms)  
SARAIVA, Jose (Mr)  
Mrs Maria de Lurdes Saraiva  
SOARES, Joao (Mr)

**Romania**

STANISOARA, Mihai (Mr)

*Head of Delegation*

**Member of Delegation**



BELASCU, Aron (Mr)  
GHEORGHE, Valeriu (Mr)  
MOIS, Vasalie (Mr)  
POPESCU LAURENTIU, Mircea (Mr)  
Mrs Olga Simonescu

TOKAY, Gheorghe (Mr)  
**Staff of Delegation**  
BOJIN, Irina (Mrs)  
*Secretary of Delegation*

**Russia**  
*Council of Federation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
VISHNYAKOV, Vitaly (Mr)  
*State Duma*  
**Staff of Delegation**  
DZAKHAEV, Semyon (Mr)  
*Secretary of Delegation*  
POLISHUK, Alexander (Mr)  
*Counsellor, Foreign Ministry*

**Slovak Republic**  
NOVOTNÝ, Viliam (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*

**Slovenia**  
BATTELLI, Roberto (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
PUCKO, Ciril (Mr)

**Spain**  
**Member of Delegation**  
ABURTO, Fatima (Ms)  
GARCIA, Blanca (Ms)  
KLIMOWITZ, Cristina (Ms)  
NIETO, Jeronimo (Mr)

**Sweden**  
TINGSGÅRD, Tone (Mrs)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Staff of Delegation**  
TOLLIN, Ingrid (Ms)

**Switzerland**  
**Staff of Delegation**  
STRITT, Suzanne (Ms)  
*Secretary of Delegation*

**Tajikistan**  
DOSTIEV, Abdulmajid (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
ISMAILOV, Shavkad (Mr)  
KARAMSHOEV, Imatsho (Mr)  
ODINAEV, Mirzodavlat (Mr)

**Turkey**  
YALCINTAS, Nevzat (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
AYALAN, Sukru (Mr)  
HACALOGLU, Algan (Mr)  
**Staff of Delegation**  
ELIBOL, Yasemin (Ms)  
*Secretary of Delegation*  
TEYCI, Mansur (Mr)  
*Advisor*

**Ukraine**  
YULII, Ioffe (Mr)  
*Head of Delegation*  
**Member of Delegation**  
MASENKO, Alexander (Mr)  
MIRONENKO, Viktor (Mr)  
ROMAN, Igor (Mr)  
VASHENKO, Alexander (Mr)

**United Kingdom**  
**Member of Delegation**  
GEORGE, Bruce (Mr)  
*President of the OSCE PA*  
HEATH, David (Mr)  
MACKINLAY, Andrew (Mr)

**Uzbekistan**  
**Member of Delegation**  
MIRZAEV, Ergash (Mr)  
SABIROV, Ilgizar (Mr)

**Partners for Cooperation****Japan**

MORISHITA, Hiroyuki (Mr)

*Head of Delegation***Member of Delegation**

SAITO, Tsuyoshi (Mr)

**Staff of Delegation**

KANDA, Shigeru (Mr)

*Secretary*

KUROKAWA, Kazuyoshi (Mr)

*Secretary*

EGUCHI, Mitsuru (Ms)

*Interpreter*

HIGUCHI, Mariko (Ms)

*Interpreter*

INOUE, Mikiko (Ms)

*Interpreter***Korea****Member of Delegation**

KYU YU, Jae (Mr)

**Staff of Delegation**

KEUM BAEK, Jong (Mr)

*Assistant***Mediterranean Partners for Cooperation****Egypt****Member of Delegation**

EL-GAMMAL, Saad Mokhammed (Mr)

EL DAADAA, Ismail Mohammed (Mr)

\*\*\*

**Parliamentary Assemblies****Inter-Parliamentary Union**

OSTASH, Ihor (Mr)

*Member of Executive Committee**Vice-President of the OSCE PA***Interparliamentary Assembly of Member****Nations of the CIS**

BAKENOV, Khalel (Mr)

*Deputy Secretary General of IPA CIS***Council of Europe Parliamentary Assembly**

ATKINSON, David (Mr)

\*\*\*

**United Nations Development Programme**

AKCURA, Fikret (Mr)

*President Representative*

KUDEKOVA, Saule (Ms)

*Parliament Project Manager*

\*\*\*

**OSCE**

KUBIŠ, Jan (Mr)

*Secretary General***OSCE Office for Democratic Institutions and Human Rights**

STROHAL, Christian (Mr)

*Director*

HENNIG, Maximilian (Mr)

RUDENSHIOLD, Eric (Mr)

VULCHANOV, Nikolai (Mr)

RAUTIO, Sirpa (Ms)

**OSCE Centre in Almaty**

MARTIN-ROZUMILOWICZ, Beata (Ms)

*Political & Mass Media Officer*

PUPOLS, Armands (Mr)

*Economic & Environmental Officer*

VIELMINI, Fabrizio (Mr)

*Human Dimensions Officer***OSCE Centre in Bishkek**

FELCH, Peter (Mr)

*Political Officer*

DJUSUNOV, Bolot (Mr)

*Public Relations & Media Officer*

\*\*\*



**Central Election Commission of the Russian Federation**

VESHNYAKOV, Alexander (Mr)  
*Chair of the CEC of the Russian Federation*  
PEREVOZCHIKOV, Vsevolod (Mr)  
CHIRKOV, Alexei (Mr)  
KURASHKIN, Alexei (Mr)

**Other Organizations and NGOs**

The Parliamentary Union of the Organization of Islamic Conference Member States

AUF, Ibrahim (Mr)  
*Secretary General*  
Mrs Enayat Rifaat

Interparliamentary Assembly of the Eurasian Economic Community

BAKENOV, Khalel (Mr)  
*Representative of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the IP of the Eurasian Economic Community*  
MARYSHEV, Anatoly (Mr)  
*Executive Secretary*

International League for Human Rights

KANTROW, Louise (Ms)  
*Executive Director*  
ZALMAYEV, Peter (Mr)  
*CIS Programme Coordinator*

American Bar Association / Central European and Eurasian Law Initiative

KRAFFCHAK, Chris (Mr)

“Ar. Rukh. Khak.”

TOREGOZHINA, Bakhytzhan (Mrs)

Association of Business Women of Kazakhstan

SARSEMAYEVA, Raushan (Mrs)  
*President*

Ecological Forum “Tabigat”

YELEUZIZOV, Mels (Mr)

*Chairman*

International Center for Journalists  
KRIMSKY, George (Mr)  
*Resident Adviser to the Print Media*

International Foundation for Protection of Freedom of Expression

KALEYEVA, Tamara (Mrs)  
*President*

International Bureau on Human Rights and Rule of Law

ZHVOTIS, Yevgeniy (Mr)  
*Director*  
TURMAGAMBETOVA, Zhemis (Ms)  
*Deputy Director*

International Republican Institute

STEWART, Donna (Mrs)

National Democratic Institute

BRIDLE, Tom (Mr)

Soros Foundatin in Kazakhstan

ZIETEK, Darius (Mr)

Ust-Kamenogorsk based NGO “Status”

UNZHAKOVA, Irina (Mrs)  
*President*

Taraz Initiative Center

BEKTURGANOVA, Alma (Mrs)  
*Director*

Geneva Centre for Democratic Control of Armed Forces (DCAF)

FLURI, Philipp (Mr)

Jane’s Information Group

BURTON, Paul (Mr)  
VATANKA, Alex (Mr)

\*\*\*

**Guest Speakers**

ABDILDIN, Zhabaikhon (Mr)  
*Member of OSCE PA Kazakh Delegation*

DE BEAUFORT, Willem Hendrik (Mr)  
*Secretary General of the Dutch House of Representatives*

CARIUS, Alexander (Mr)  
*Director of Adelphi Research*

DUKHOVNY, Victor (Mr)  
*Director of the Scientific Information Centre of the Interstate Coordination Water Commission of Central Asia*

ISMAILOV, Shavkad (Mr)  
*Chair of the Committee on Defense, Parliament of Tajikistan*

KELIMBETOV, Kairat (Mr)  
*Minister of Economy and Budget Planning of Kazakhstan*

PASCOE, Lynn (Mr)  
*Deputy Assistant Secretary of State for European and Eurasian Affairs, U.S.A.*

SANTOS, Maria (Ms)  
*Member of the Portuguese Delegation*

STROHAL, Christian (Mr)  
*ODIHR Director*

TAN, Ahmet (Mr)  
*Journalist, Former Vice-President of the OSCE PA*

Former Vice-President of the OSCE PA

TINGSGÅRD, Tone (Mrs)  
*Head of OSCE PA Swedish Delegation*

TOKAEV, Kasymzhomart (Mr)  
*Foreign Minister of Kazakhstan*

VESHNYAKOV, Alexander (Mr)  
*Chair of the CEC of the Russian Federation*

**Senior Officials of the Republic of Kazakhstan**

ABYKAEV, Nurtai (Mr)  
*Head of Presidential Administration*

TAZHIN, Marat (Mr)  
*First Deputy Head of Presidential Administration*

ROGOV, Igor (Mr)  
*Deputy Head of Presidential Administration*

OKSYKBAYEV, Omarkhan (Mr)  
*Secretary of Security Council*

ABDRAIMOV, Bakhytzhan (Mr)  
*Head of Representation of the President in Parliament*

ZHUMABEKOV, Onalsyn (Mr)  
*Minister of Justice*

KELIMBETOV, Kairat (Mr)  
*Minister of Economy and Budget Planning*

OTTO, Ivan (Mr)  
*Deputy Minister of Internal Affairs*

BALIEVA, Zagipa (Ms)  
*Chair of Central Election Commission*

BYCHKOVA, Svetlana (Ms)  
*Member of Constitutional Council*

**Organizing Committee**

ABUSEYTOV, Kairat (Mr)  
*First Deputy Foreign Minister*

DARIMBETOV, Baidaly (Mr)  
*Deputy of Presidential Administration*

KUL-MUKHAMMED, Mukhtar (Mr)  
*Minister of Culture, Information and Public Consent*

SULEIMENOV, Kairbek (Mr)  
*Minister of Internal Affairs*

KURENBЕКOV, Amantai (Mr)  
*Deputy Head*

KULMUKHANOV, Zhalbai (Mr)  
*Akym of the Province of Almaty*

KHRAPUNOV, Viktor (Mr)  
*Akym of the City of Almaty*

KARIBZHANOV, Khairat (Mr)  
*Deputy Minister of Transport and Communication*

DOSZHAN, Ardak (Mr)  
*Deputy Minister of Culture, Information and Public Consent*

**Working Group of the Parliament of Kazakhstan**

ZHOLSHIBEKOV, Amzebek (Mr)  
*Secretary General of the Senate*

TOLKANTCHINOV, Anuar (Mr)  
*Secretary General of the Majilis*

SERIKBAI, Tazhikhan (Mr)



*Deputy Secretary General of the Senate*  
OSIPOV, Vasilii (Mr)

*Deputy Secretary General of the Majilis*  
TEZEKBAEV, Serik (Mr)

*Head of the Economic Department of the Parliament*

BEKBOSYN, Argynbai (Mr)

*Head of the Department of Press and Public Affairs*

VOLKOV, Vladimir (Mr)

*Head of the Organizing Department of the Senate*

ISMAGULOVA, Bakhytzhama (Ms)

*Head of Human Resources of the Senate*

OMAROV, Baltabai (Mr)

*Head of Inter-Parliamentary Relations*

*Department of the Senate*

TOKHTAROV, Sergei (Mr)

*Head of the International Relations Department of the Majilis*

ADILBEKOVA, Bayan (Ms)

*Deputy Head of Inter-Parliamentary Relations of the Senate*

LITOVCHENKO, Anatolii (Mr)

*Deputy Head of the Documents Department of the Senate*

SAGINOVA, Zhanna (Ms)

*Deputy Head of International Relations*

*Department of the Majilis*

LUKIN, Mikhail (Mr)

*Deputy Head of the Economic Department of the Parliament*

**International Secretariat**

OLIVER, Spencer (Mr)

*Secretary General*

Mrs Jeanie Anne Oliver

EVSEYEV, Vitaly (Mr)

*Deputy Secretary General*

JOOREN, Jan (Mr)

*Counsellor for Press and Public Affairs*

Mrs Marjolijn Jooren

ANDERSEN, Kurt (Mr)

*General Services Officer*

JANISCH, Almuth (Ms)

*Conference Coordinator*

LEGENDRE, Paul (Mr)

*Programme Officer*

PALLARES, Gustavo (Mr)

*Advisor to the President*

RICHARDSON, Sophie (Ms)

*Assistant to the Secretary General*

SCHØN, Tina (Ms)

*Programme Officer*

BAKER, Andreas (Mr)

*Research Assistant*

**Interpreters**

EDGINGTON, Rebecca (Ms)

EMERY, Catherine (Ms)

FEDOROV, Alexei (Mr)

GANSON, Catherine (Ms)

GOLYBINE, Dmitri (Mr)

NERCESSIAN, Michel (Mr)

\*\*\*

**Diplomatic Corps**

**Embassy of Afghanistan**

KASIMI, Husain (Mr)

ELIAS, Mahmood (Mr)

SHAH AKBARI, Said Zahiz (Mr)

**Embassy of Belarus**

DZOZDOV, Anatolii (Mr)

**Embassy of Bulgaria**

DEKOV, Dimitar (Mr)

*Ambassador*

NENOV, Htanas (Mr)

*First Secretary*

**Embassy of China**

YAO, Peishen (Mr)

*Ambassador*

BENYAN, Zhan (Mr)

ZHAN, Benyan (Mr)  
YAO, Peishen (Mr)

**Embassy of Hungary**

SHANDOR, Chikosh (Mr)

**Embassy of Israel**

KAMHI, Moshe (Mr)  
*Ambassador to Kazakhstan*  
ALKUKIN, Salin (Mr)  
*Deputy chief of Mission*

**Embassy of Japan**

TSUNOZAKI, Toshio (Mr)  
*Ambassador*  
TOKUNAGA, Hiroki (Mr)  
*Counsellor*  
WATANABE, Hideto (Mr)  
*Third Secretary*  
CHIMURA, Aki (Ms)  
*Attache*  
TANAKA, Moeko (Ms)  
*Attache*  
BISENGALI, Kenesari (Mr)  
*Interpreter*  
ZHAKSYBAEVA, Nazerke (Ms)  
*Secretary*  
MOLOTOVA, Adalyat (Ms)  
*Secretary*

**Embassy of Korea**

TAE SUK, Won (Mr)  
*Ambassador*  
TAE WOO, Lee (Mr)  
*Consul Genreal*  
WONGCHANG, La (Mr)  
*Second Secretary Consul*  
NAM, Natalya (Ms)  
*Interpreter*

**Embassy of Kyrgyzstan**

SAADANBEKOV, Zhumagul (Mr)  
*Ambassador*  
ZAKIROV, Sultan (Mr)

SHAIKENOV, Barlyk (Mr)

**Embassy of the Netherlands**

VAN LEEUWEN, P. (Mr)

**Embassy of Romania**

SOARE, Vasile (Mr)  
*Ambassador*

**Embassy of Russia**

KOPEYKO, Sergey (Mr)  
*Counsellor*

**Embassy of Spain**

DE LA PARTE, Francisco Pascual (Mr)

**Embassy of Turkey**

CHINAR, Aldemir (Mr)  
*Ambassador*  
BORA, Kerimoglu (Mr)  
*Counsellor*  
BAHR, Batu (Mr)  
*3rd Secretary*  
TOLGA, Guleryuz (Ms)  
*Attache*  
SEMBI, Zhamilya (Ms)  
*Interpreter*  
SEMBI, Zhamilya (Ms)

**Embassy of the U.K.**

SHARP, James, (Mr)  
*Ambassador*  
HINCHON, David (Mr)  
*Third Secretary Political*

**Embassy of U.S.A.**

NAPPER, Larry (Mr)  
*Ambassador*  
O'KEETE, Monica (Mrs)  
RUSSELL, Dan (Mr)



**T**he OSCE Parliamentary Assembly is the parliamentary dimension of the Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe, whose 56 participating States span the geographical area from Vancouver to Vladivostok.

The primary task of the 320 member Assembly is to facilitate inter-parliamentary dialogue, an important aspect of the overall effort to meet the challenges of democracy throughout the OSCE area. Recognized as a regional arrangement under Chapter VIII of the United Nations Charter, the OSCE is a primary instrument for early warning, conflict prevention, crisis management and post-conflict rehabilitation in its area. The Parliamentary Assembly, originally established by the 1990 Paris Summit to promote greater involvement in the OSCE by national parliaments, has grown into a very active and esteemed member of the OSCE family.

The basic objectives of the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly are:

- To assess the implementation of OSCE objectives by participating States;
- To discuss subjects addressed during meetings of the Ministerial Council and the summits of Heads of State or Government;
- To develop and promote mechanisms for the prevention and resolution of conflicts;
- To support the strengthening and consolidation of democratic institutions in OSCE participating States;
- To contribute to the development of OSCE institutional structures and of relations between existing OSCE Institutions.

To pursue these objectives, the OSCE Parliamentary Assembly employs a variety of means:

- A Final Declaration and a number of resolutions and recommendations are adopted each year at the Annual Session in July;
- Committee work addresses important contemporary international issues;
- Programmes and Seminars designed to develop and strengthen democracy including an extensive election observation programme;
- Special parliamentary missions to areas of latent or active crisis.





**OSCE PA**

PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

UNITED NATIONS DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME  
PARLIAMENT OF THE REPUBLIC OF KAZAKHSTAN

**TRANSASIAN  
PARLIAMENTARY  
FORUM**

7-9 June 2003, Almaty, Kazakhstan

**OSCE Parliamentary Assembly**

International Secretariat

Rådhusstræde 1

1466 Copenhagen K

Denmark

Telephone: +45 3337 8040

Telefax: +45 3337 8030

E-mail: [osce@oscepa.dk](mailto:osce@oscepa.dk)

Internet: [www.osce.org/pa](http://www.osce.org/pa)